Hangzhou Accountability Assessment

G20 Framework Working Group

Executive Summary

The accountability framework is an important pillar of the G20's work in its pursuit of strong, sustainable and balanced growth. The 2016 Accountability Assessment Report takes stock of members' latest progress towards this overarching objective, including the progress on implementation of the growth strategies put forward at the Brisbane and Antalya Summits in 2014 and 2015 respectively. It complements the Hangzhou Action Plan which presents the overall narrative on how the G20 is fostering growth and, in particular, outlines additional reform commitments members are putting forward in 2016.

While G20 members have made progress with the implementation of measures aimed at fostering strong, sustainable and balanced growth, the global conditions for growth remain challenging. The global economic recovery continues but **growth remains insufficiently strong** in the face of weakening productivity growth, population aging, high private and public debt levels following the global financial crisis combined with prolonged low inflation and uneven job creation in some countries. Downside risks persist, with increased uncertainty in the past year. The persistent fragility and unevenness of the recovery in some economies suggest that **global growth is not yet sufficiently sustainable**. A number of non-economic shocks also have the potential to impact significantly on future global economic activity. After showing signs of retrenchment in the years following the global financial crisis, global external imbalances increased slightly in 2015 prompting concern that **growth may again be becoming more unbalanced**. In addition, in some economies there is growing concern that the benefits of economic growth from globalization are not sufficiently inclusive. Weakened support for globalization could reduce momentum for openness to trade, investment and other engines of growth, which could lead to lower and less sustainable global growth.

With respect to the implementation of the growth strategies, the 2016 accountability assessment indicates that **G20 members have made further progress**, with 55 per cent of key commitments identified in the Brisbane growth strategies and 45 per cent of the key commitments included in the Antalya growth strategies fully implemented to date. However, implementation varies among members. The International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) estimate that the structural reform measures in the growth strategies that are quantifiable and that have already been fully implemented would increase collective G20 Gross Domestic Product (GDP) by an additional 1.0 per cent by 2018. Thus there is a need for G20 members to take concrete steps to **accelerate implementation of their growth strategy commitments** in order to meet the ambition of lifting collective G20 GDP by an additional 2 per cent by 2018.

G20 members recognize the need to accelerate implementation of growth strategy commitments and are **committed to using all policy tools** – monetary, fiscal and structural – individually and collectively, while ensuring that debt as a share of GDP is on a sustainable path, to achieve stronger, more sustainable and balanced growth. Over the past year, G20 members continue to use monetary policies to support economic activity and ensure price stability, consistent with central banks' mandates. Nevertheless, monetary policy alone cannot lead to sustainable and balanced growth. Moreover, the availability and use of fiscal space remain challenging for many members. Most advanced economies have managed to lower their deficit-to-GDP ratios since 2010. However, for many, public debt-to-GDP ratios are still rising. In emerging market economies, public debt-to-GDP ratios have generally been lower than those in advanced economies but are expected to rise, at least in the short term, due to various challenges, including slowing growth and the lingering effects of lower commodity prices. In this regard, G20 members agree that improving the quality of budget expenditures and revenues can be instrumental to support growth, especially in countries with no fiscal space.

Overall, the results of the 2016 accountability assessment reiterate the need for the G20 to remain steadfast in its implementation of all of its policy commitments in full and a timely manner. The G20 will continue to monitor progress on its commitments and will undertake another accountability assessment in 2017.

1. Introduction

Strong, sustainable and balanced growth is the overarching objective of the G20. This also contributes to the implementation of the Agenda 2030 for sustainable development. Since it was established in 2012 in Los Cabos, the Accountability Assessment Report has been instrumental in ensuring that the G20 continues to make progress towards this objective.

The 2016 Accountability Assessment Report focuses on developments since the last report was published at the 2015 Leaders' Summit in Antalya. In addition to taking stock of the G20's latest progress towards achieving strong, sustainable and balanced growth, this year's report also includes an assessment of progress with the implementation of the growth strategies first conceived in 2014 under the Australian Presidency.

The current accountability assessment framework builds on the principles of member ownership, a "comply or explain" approach, concreteness, consistency across members, fairness, and openness and transparency. It includes a peer review process where members' policies are examined by one another, informed by technical assessments from international organizations. Members have the opportunity to respond to these peer reviews. The G20 would like to thank the international organizations, particularly the IMF, the OECD, and the World Bank Group (WBG), for their important contributions to this process.

2. Updates on Moving towards Strong, Sustainable and Balanced Growth

G20 members have put forward a wide range of notable macroeconomic and structural reform actions to foster growth over the years and continue to make progress in implementing them. However, the global economic recovery has been modest and uneven, and conditions for growth remain challenging. This means further efforts are needed to meet the G20's overarching objective of strong, sustainable and balanced growth.

1. ***Growth is not sufficiently strong***. Seven years after the end of the global financial crisis, the global economic recovery continues but remains weaker than desirable (Figure 1). Despite continued growth in employment in emerging market economies and employment surpassing the pre-crisis level in advanced economies (Figure 2), estimates of future global growth have been repeatedly downgraded in the post-crisis years. The difficulty to generate a more substantial liftoff in global economic activity has been attributed to a combination of pre-existing challenges that weigh on potential growth such as weakening productivity growth and population aging; crisis legacies, particularly high private and public debt levels; and, post-crisis complications, including persistent weakness in wages and investment in some major advanced

economies. Together, these factors have led to sustained output gaps and prolonged low inflation in some advanced economies. In particular, members remain concerned about the shortfall in global aggregate demand. While some advanced economies continue to make progress in reducing unemployment (Figure 3), and in some of these economies unemployment is at historically low rates, in other advanced economies, jobless rates and underemployment remain above pre-crisis levels. Meanwhile, there is concern that slowing growth and recent recessions in some large emerging market economies could lead to further increases in unemployment and underemployment.

2. ***Growth is insufficiently sustainable.*** Weakening potential growth in a number of G20 members due to aging and slowing productivity growth, if sustained, indicates a worsening of long-term growth prospects. Moreover, uncertainty in the global economy has increased since the Antalya Summit, and risks of weaker growth remain elevated. High corporate debt in certain sectors such as energy and in particular countries, especially in emerging markets, also poses significant financial stability risks. Developments such as the outcome of the United Kingdom (UK) referendum on EU membership have increased economic and financial uncertainties, and other non-economic risk factors such as geopolitical tensions, terrorism, the refugee crisis, and global epidemics also have the potential for significant impact on global economic activity. In the face of these pressures and limited policy space, most G20 members have been cautious in their responses. A number of advanced and emerging market economies are still working to reduce fiscal deficits and bring down public debt. G20 members recognize that a conscious effort is needed to ensure that fiscal policy should remain growth-friendly, while ensuring debt as a share of GDP is on a sustainable path. In particular, members are actively discussing the availability of fiscal policy space, its optimal utilisation, as well as the efficiency of composition of public expenditure and revenues. In the meantime, G20 members continue to use monetary policy measures to support economic activity and ensure price stability, although there is recognition that monetary policy alone cannot address all the challenges that remain.

3. ***Growth remains imbalanced*.** After showing signs of retrenchment in the years following the global financial crisis, global external imbalances increased slightly in 2015 (Figure 4). In several systemic economies, imbalances are still relatively high and growing. Furthermore, some of the current account improvements that have been achieved so far may not be entirely durable as they may reflect transitory factors. In particular, while some members have been able to narrow their excessive current account imbalances through important structural reforms, a key concern is that some adjustments in surplus economies are mainly due to demand compression in deficit countries. In addition, uneven recoveries and expectations about monetary policies have contributed to marked exchange rate movements across systemic currencies, which in some instances have contributed to the widening of external imbalances. G20 members recognize the need to continue to discuss how excessive imbalances may be reduced. Moreover, there is rising concern among some members that the accommodative monetary policy that is pursued in some countries may contribute to unbalanced growth, in particular if continued for too long. In addition, in some economies there is now growing concern that the benefits of economic growth from globalization are not sufficiently inclusive. Weakened support for globalization could reduce momentum for openness to trade, investment and other engines of growth, which could lead to slower, less durable and less inclusive future global economic growth. Members recognize that the G20 can show leadership in addressing this concern by ensuring that our policy actions promote more balanced and inclusive growth.

The developments noted above underscore the need for concerted efforts by the G20 to support growth and address the sources of risks. G20 members need a comprehensive response, using all available policy tools - monetary, fiscal and structural - individually and collectively, to deliver on its objective of strong, sustainable and balanced growth.

3. Actions to Foster Strong, Sustainable and Balanced Growth

Of the G20’s numerous important actions over the years to support the global economy, one notable initiative has been the member-specific comprehensive growth strategies first conceived in 2014 and published at the Brisbane Leaders’ Summit. In addition to macroeconomic policy actions, the growth strategies included new structural reform commitments aimed at addressing key rigidities and distortions in members’ economies that would lead to stronger growth. These strategies were adjusted in 2015 and again in 2016 to ensure their relevance in the face of changing economic conditions and policy priorities.

3.1 Structural Reform Policy Commitments

Structural reforms are an important component of the G20’s efforts to achieve strong, sustainable and balanced growth and a key focus of the growth strategies. Structural reforms and macroeconomic policies, including fiscal and monetary measures, can be complementary and mutually reinforcing in supporting growth.

At the Brisbane Summit in 2014, G20 members pledged to raise G20 collective GDP by an additional 2 per cent by 2018 (the collective growth ambition) through the implementation of the structural reform commitments contained in their growth strategies. In total, more than 1400 structural reform commitments have been put forward in members’ Brisbane growth strategies and Antalya adjusted growth strategies. G20 members are also providing an update of their growth strategies in 2016 at the Hangzhou Summit with new policy commitments. This report focuses on reviewing members’ performance with the implementation of the growth strategy commitments made in Brisbane and Antalya. An assessment of progress towards the implementation of the 2016 commitments will be discussed in future accountability assessment reports.

Since the last Accountability Assessment Report was published at the 2015 Antalya Summit, G20 members have continued to demonstrate progress in implementing their growth strategy commitments; however, the overall pace of implementation has been slower than initially expected by international organizations. In particular, the increase in the number of measures fully completed since the Antalya Summit has been modest. According to an assessment by the IMF and the OECD, structural reform measures that are quantifiable and that have already been fully implemented by the Hangzhou Summit would raise collective G20 GDP by an additional 1.0 per cent by 2018, slightly above the 0.8 per cent estimated in 2015 at the time of the Antalya Summit. Assuming full implementation by next year of measures that are already in progress, current estimates suggest an effect of 1.5 per cent of collective GDP by 2018 and more in subsequent years. Given that the G20 is already at the end of the third year of the five-year horizon for its collective growth ambition, this result underscores the urgent need for members to strengthen efforts to fully implement their existing growth strategy commitments and to undertake further actions, where relevant.

The following sections provide greater detail on the implementation progress of members’ growth strategy commitments as well as progress within the four thematic areas of the Brisbane growth strategies, i.e. investment, employment, competition and trade. While based on analysis by international organizations, in line with the G20's member-led, member-owned approach, the following assessment has been prepared following consultations amongst members.

3.1.1 Key Commitments from Brisbane and Antalya Growth Strategies

To ensure that the accountability assessment process places emphasis on the most important measures while remaining manageable given the vast number of commitments in the Brisbane and Antalya growth strategies, monitoring of progress of growth strategy commitments has been focused on a subset of "key commitments" (Annex 1). These key commitments have been selected by members based on their policy priorities as well as economic impact.

According to the IMF, the OECD and the WBG, G20 members have made modest progress since the Antalya Summit with the implementation of their key growth strategy commitments put forward in Brisbane and Antalya. The share of Brisbane key commitments that have been fully implemented has increased to 55 per cent from 49 per cent at the time of the Antalya Summit. However, implementation progress varies markedly by country. For example, Canada, France, Italy, Korea and Spain have fully implemented more than two thirds of their Brisbane and Antalya key commitments whereas seven members have completed less than one third of their key commitments. A further 43 per cent of the total key commitments are in progress, while about 2 per cent show no or limited progress.

Of all the additional key commitments that were put forward in members' adjusted growth strategies at the Antalya Summit, 45 per cent have been fully implemented, 39 per cent are in progress, and the remaining 15 per cent show no or limited progress.

Investment Policies

Among the four thematic areas of the Brisbane growth strategies, investment and infrastructure development were a major focus of all G20 members' key commitments. In 2015, recognizing the need to address structural constraints that weighed on growth, members made additional commitments that included expanding investments in infrastructure projects and moving towards more investment-friendly tax systems.

Status of Implementation

Over the past year, some members (Argentina, Australia, Brazil, European Union (EU), Korea) have fully implemented a small number of Brisbane investment-related key commitments. Furthermore, a number of measures announced in Antalya have also been completed in the areas of creating investment-friendly environments through tax measures and regulation and improved institutional efficiency, and providing additional investment in infrastructure, particularly in transportation (Australia, Canada, China, EU, France, Germany, India, Italy, Spain, UK). Overall, about 47 per cent of Brisbane and 54 per cent of Antalya investment policy commitments have now been fully implemented.

Members have continued to make progress in developing a range of public infrastructure projects over the past year. Some members are considering more innovative funding and financing mechanisms, including expanding the use of Public-Private Partnerships (PPP), while others are exploring alternative sources of funding for infrastructure such as multilateral development banks, to support and encourage additional private sector investment while reducing the fiscal burden of increased public investment (India). Some members (Argentina, Australia, Brazil, China, Germany, India, Mexico, Russia, Saudi

Arabia, UK, United States (US)) are building, maintaining and improving public infrastructure while a number of members (France, Germany, Indonesia, Japan) are increasing connectivity and expanding access to telecommunication and digital infrastructure and promoting investments in next generation healthcare industry. Some members also continue to improve efficiency of public investment in infrastructure (Russia).

Members also continue to improve the ease of doing business by enhancing the stability and transparency of their investment environments (China, Indonesia, Turkey, UK), simplifying tax-related investment measures (France, South Africa), facilitating growth of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) and entrepreneurs by providing subsidies or facilitating access to credit (Brazil, Italy, Mexico, Korea, Russia, South Africa, Spain, Turkey), expanding the use of PPPs (India, Korea, South Africa), encouraging foreign investment or broadening market entry by foreign investors (Australia, China, Indonesia), and improving the investment-related institutional and regulatory frameworks (China, Brazil, EU, France, Italy, India, Japan, Saudi Arabia, South Africa).

Overall, very few measures in the area of investment and infrastructure have been identified as demonstrating no or limited progress. However, peer reviewers have identified some risks to full implementation by 2018. One is the persistence of adverse macroeconomic conditions that could have fiscal implications for some members, as these could potentially lead to some delays or scaling back of public infrastructure projects. Another is the political challenge of working with multiple decision and implementation procedures and authorities. In addition, a handful of projects have completion horizons beyond 2018.

Employment Policies

Nearly a third of all growth strategy commitments in Brisbane were designed explicitly to address employment policy gaps and create more and better quality jobs. Building on these measures, new growth strategy commitments in Antalya were focused on promoting skills development, education and training.

Status of Implementation

Overall, members have fully implemented about 59 per cent of the Brisbane and 31 per cent of the Antalya employment policy commitments. These measures fall into the areas of promoting entrepreneurs and self-employment, increasing incentives to work by reducing labour taxes or adjusting compensation systems, and helping employers to take on the unemployed, youth, women, or foreign workers (Argentina, Australia, France, India, Italy, Korea, Spain, South Africa).

Steady progress is being made with the remaining measures, with some being relatively close to full implementation. For example, a number of measures have been legislated and are pending a wider roll-out of a program, or have reached the final stage of interim steps for implementation (EU, France, Spain, Turkey, UK). Other measures that are ongoing include commitments to enhancing equity in pay and opportunity for women (Germany, Japan, Saudi Arabia, Turkey, US), facilitating access to childcare and preschool programs (Australia, Germany, Japan, Saudi Arabia, UK, US), incentivizing people to return to work through targeted support, better compensation packages or adjustments to unemployment benefits (EU, UK), increasing the labour supply through immigration or by improving the employment conditions for temporary/migrant workers (China, Germany), reducing structural rigidities in the labour market (France, Germany, Turkey), and promoting skills and human capital development in particular for women and youth (Australia, Canada, China, EU, India, Turkey).

However, progress has been minimal in a few areas. In addition to the commitment to raise the federal minimum wage (US), some of the sub-measures of broader commitments to facilitate the provision of and access to childcare and preschool programs (Australia, UK, US) as well as a measure to adjust unemployment benefits to encourage people to return to the workforce (France) have shown limited progress. In some cases, the situation reflects legislative delays caused by political uncertainties.

Competition Policies

Brisbane and Antalya commitments included competition policies in the areas of reforming goods and services market, reducing regulatory burdens and red tape, lowering barriers to entry for new businesses and promoting competition in network industries.

Status of Implementation

Overall, members have fully implemented about 60 per cent of their Brisbane and 62 per cent of their Antalya competition policy commitments. However, members have made relatively little progress with implementation over the past year, with only a few more Brisbane commitments being fully implemented since the Antalya Summit. These recently implemented measures mostly fall in the area of supporting a competitive business environment by streamlining and reducing administrative processes as well as regulatory burdens (Brazil, China, France, India, Italy, Korea, South Africa). Moreover, members have implemented a relatively small portion of their commitments from the Antalya adjusted growth strategies. Measures that have been fully implemented focus on reducing regulatory burdens (China, India, Indonesia, Italy, Korea, Spain, South Africa).

Competition measures that are still in progress include lowering barriers to entry for businesses (Australia, Italy, Spain) and fostering a competitive business environment (China, Indonesia, Mexico, Turkey). Some of these in-progress measures have encountered legislative delays or the need to bring regulations in line with new laws, resulting in modest delays in meeting original timelines but remaining on track for full implementation by 2018.

There are also a couple of commitments that have shown no or minimal progress so far, such as developing the mechanisms to awarding contracting projects (Saudi Arabia). In addition, a few measures may be fully implemented only after 2018 due to having longer planning horizons or no specific deadline.

Trade Policies

In addition to the trade initiatives which were put forward in Brisbane, G20 members made further trade-related commitments in Antalya. These Antalya commitments focused on the negotiation of additional free trade agreements or further integration of markets. Certain members also put forward national export strategies for different sectors.

Status of Implementation

Overall, about 53 per cent of Brisbane and 15 per cent of Antalya trade policy commitments have now been fully implemented. Brisbane commitments that have been fully implemented since Antalya include policies to enhance exporters' access to foreign markets (Russia), streamline customs processes (Brazil, China, India, Korea, Turkey) and conclude and ratify trade agreements (Australia, Canada, Saudi Arabia).

A number of measures continue to be in progress, including measures to streamline customs procedures (Japan, Russia, Saudi Arabia, South Africa), facilitate increase in exports (Brazil, Russia, Saudi Arabia), conclude and ratify trade agreements (China), and further liberalize trade bilaterally (EU) and at the multilateral level through the World Trade Organization (WTO) (EU, Indonesia), where important progress was made at the 10th WTO Ministerial Conference.

Commitments that have shown no or minimal progress include improving taxation-related measures to support exports (Brazil) and ratification as well as implementation of concluded trade agreements (Canada). Peer reviewers noted that complexities related to multiple implementation authorities, such as requiring multiple countries to ratify agreements before they can come into force, have delayed implementation in some cases.

Key Commitments in Other Areas

A portion of members' Brisbane and Antalya commitments fall outside the four thematic areas discussed above. These include policies to promote more inclusive growth, to improve the business environment through targeted industry support, to reform public finances and increase the efficiency of the public sector, to reform the financial sector, and to promote innovation and development of new industries. There are also commitments to improve the quality of institutions and to support structural shifts in the economy such as urbanization.

Status of Implementation

Over half of members' key commitments outside of the four thematic areas have now been fully implemented, particularly in the areas of financial sector policies (China, Italy, Spain) and fiscal reforms to strengthen economic growth (China, Spain).

Measures for which implementation remains ongoing include reviewing government expenditures to increase revenue and identify efficiencies (India), modernizing the tax system (China, Indonesia), increasing housing development (UK), and easing financial access for SMEs (Brazil, Indonesia).

There are several measures where some members have made no or minimal progress. In the past year, Brazil saw limited progress in reducing the fiscal deficit, in spite of efforts to reduce expenditures in real terms, given that real revenues fell in reaction of a deep recession, and to eliminate distortive fuel and electric power subsidies, re-established energy market prices and discontinued Treasury loans to the National Development Bank. Elsewhere, there is a risk that a small number of measures may not be completed by 2018 as their initial timelines have been pushed back partly due to legislative delay, in addition to a few measures that have no specific deadline (ongoing measures) or where the original implementation timeline extends beyond 2018.

3.1.2 Non-Key Commitments from Brisbane and Antalya Growth Strategies

Despite the above focus on the key commitments, G20 members pledged to implement all the measures in their Brisbane and Antalya growth strategies. The monitoring of the implementation of non-key commitments continues in 2016 through members' self-reporting and peer reviewers' observations.

Progress with the implementation of non-key commitments is notably slower than with key commitments. Of those members who are reporting progress on their non-key commitments, only four members (Argentina, Italy, Korea, UK) have completed more than half. Overall, nearly 30 per cent of the non-key commitments have been completed with a further 41 per cent in progress.

A few peer reviewers recommended that some members implement their commitments more rapidly or better prioritize measures for implementation. It was also noted that some of the non-key measures do not have specific deliverables or timelines, or have timelines that extend beyond 2018, making it difficult to determine when these measures have been "fully implemented". In addition, an adverse macroeconomic environment, limited fiscal space, upcoming elections or political instability as well as challenges of working with other implementation authorities may pose a risk to the full implementation of some non-key commitments.

3.1.3 Pre-Brisbane Commitments

In 2016, members continued to make progress on selected structural reform measures from their pre-Brisbane Action Plans. Notable progress over the past year was made in promoting employment (Australia, Korea), reforming the financial sector (Argentina, China) and reforming public finances (Brazil, Italy). A few members noted that some of their pre-Brisbane commitments overlap with their Brisbane and Antalya growth strategy commitments (Canada, EU, France, Italy) and consequently reported implementation progress against these commitments within these. In addition, while some measures have specific targets or timelines, many represent ongoing efforts to pursue structural reform.

3.1.4 Limitations of Assessment

The assessment discussed above has some important technical limitations. Firstly, the quantitative assessment of the collective growth ambition by international organizations, based on models, covers only structural commitments in the growth strategies that are quantifiable. It does not assess the impact of macroeconomic measures nor structural measures that also directly support short-term aggregate demand, some of which, such as infrastructure spending, may have a relatively large impact on GDP by 2018. This results in the non-assessment of a considerable portion of commitments put forward by members, some of which could have the potential to boost growth. Secondly, the qualitative assessment is simply a description of progress on the implementation of G20 members' structural reform commitments and does not constitute an evaluation of the impact and effectiveness of the implemented measures. Furthermore, in certain cases, distinguishing between measures that are in progress with implementation and those demonstrating no or limited progress can be difficult.

3.1.5 Enhanced Structural Reform Agenda

Under the Chinese Presidency in 2016, members adopted an enhanced structural reform agenda which includes a set of priorities and guiding principles as a reference for G20 reform efforts, as well as a set of policy and outcome indicators to further improve assessing and monitoring of the progress of structural reforms and their adequacy to address structural challenges, taking into account the diversity of country circumstances. Some of the challenges and issues as identified by the OECD that G20 members face in these nine priority areas are as follows:

- *Promoting trade and investment openness:* International trade growth and global investment both remain weak. Reducing barriers to trade and investment would increase international competition, accelerate technology diffusion and strengthen the incentives for firms to make productivity improvements and undertake new investments.

- *Advancing labour market reform, educational attainment and skills:* Many G20 members face high and persistent unemployment and/or a large informal labour force. Reducing barriers to labour force participation, including for groups with low participation rates such as women, youth and older workers, and hiring by firms would help better match workers with jobs. At the same time, improving equal access to education, investing in skills and opportunities for high quality education and training would support both employment and more inclusive growth.
- *Encouraging innovation:* The level of research and development (R&D) spending, as well as public support through direct funding and tax incentives for R&D is low for a number of G20 members. In other members, the effectiveness and efficiency of R&D and public-private research collaboration could be significantly improved. Investment in innovation facilitates the absorption of new technologies and ideas hence boosting productivity.
- *Improving infrastructure:* The level of public investment and total investment in infrastructure varies significantly across G20 members. Needs include the upgrading of existing infrastructure and the provision of more basic infrastructure which can hold back private-sector activity and productivity growth when absent. At the same time efficiency of infrastructure investment should also be improved.
- *Promoting competition and an enabling environment:* Burdensome regulations exist in a number of G20 economies. Removing restrictive regulations, enhancing the rule of law and ensuring effective competition creates stronger incentives for firms to develop new and more efficient activities, thereby boosting productivity and employment growth.
- *Improving and strengthening the financial system:* Appropriate financial regulation and reforms to address financial market imperfections are critical to ensuring financial stability while financing investment for productivity growth.
- *Promoting fiscal reform:* In many G20 countries, there is room for improving the quality of public finances. Making our tax policies and public expenditures more growth-friendly, including by prioritizing high-quality investment, while enhancing resilience and ensuring debt as a share of GDP is on a sustainable path, can play a critical role in fostering growth, productivity and inclusiveness. Broadening the tax base, fighting tax fraud and evasion and eliminating inefficient tax expenditures would support growth and contribute to a fairer distribution of the tax burden.
- *Enhancing environmental sustainability:* Governments can enhance environmental sustainability by aiding the investment and development of new clean and efficient technologies and infrastructure as well as enhancing the use of market based mechanisms.
- *Promoting inclusive growth:* Income inequality has increased in most G20 countries in the past decade. In some G20 economies, inequality has recently decreased but generally remains high. Reducing inequalities requires, among others, improving equality of opportunities, providing social transfers and income redistribution programs that are well targeted and designed, as well as reducing barriers to gender equality.

In their 2016 update of the growth strategies, G20 members made commitments on a voluntary basis relating to the nine priority areas. The status of implementation of these new commitments related to the nine priority areas will be addressed in future accountability assessments. The OECD will help to assess progress and challenges within the structural reform priority areas by producing a technical report, with input from other international organizations, using the common indicator system adopted by members this year. We will look for opportunities to continue to improve the G20's enhanced structural reform agenda. This enhanced structural reform agenda will be incorporated into the existing work stream of the Framework Working Group (FWG) as a tool to help assist members' structural reform efforts. Building on the foundation laid in 2016, other policy and outcome indicators may be added in future years to enhance the system.

3.2 Macroeconomic Policy Commitments

Macroeconomic policy plays a key role in the global recovery by supporting demand in the short term, and helping to create favourable conditions for the effective implementation of structural reforms to strengthen long-term growth. Since 2009, G20 members have put forward a wide range of measures in the areas of fiscal, monetary and exchange rate policies in action plans every year. The following sections discuss the current status of implementation of members' commitments in these areas.

3.2.1 Fiscal Policy

Key Commitments:

Fiscal commitments have evolved over time. At the 2010 Toronto Summit, when the global recovery appeared well in place, most advanced economy members committed to at least halve 2010 government deficits as a share of GDP by 2013 and to stabilize or reduce government debt-to-GDP ratios by 2016. In 2012, in Los Cabos, Leaders agreed that the pace of fiscal consolidation should be appropriate to support the recovery, taking country-specific circumstances into account and, in line with the Toronto commitments, should address concerns about medium-term fiscal sustainability. In 2013 in St. Petersburg, advanced economies, agreed to set out medium-term fiscal strategies to support fiscal sustainability. A number of emerging market economies have also laid out key elements of their strategies to promote fiscal sustainability. G20 members agreed to implement these strategies flexibly to take into account near-term economic conditions so as to support economic growth and job creation while putting debt as a share of GDP on a sustainable path. Many members updated their St. Petersburg fiscal strategies as part of their growth strategies for the Brisbane Summit and their adjusted growth strategies for both the Antalya and Hangzhou Summits taking into account policy developments, short-term growth and inflation developments. In February 2016, as part of the Shanghai communiqué, G20 members agreed to use all policy tools – monetary, fiscal, and structural – and reaffirmed the role of mutually-reinforcing macroeconomic and structural policies to buttress their efforts to achieve strong, sustainable and balanced growth.

Assessment of Progress:

Given the challenging economic environment, many G20 members are trying to strike the right balance between supporting growth and the sustainability of public finances. A number of advanced economies (Australia, France, Germany, Italy, Spain, UK, US) have made progress in achieving the original Toronto target (Figure 5), mostly through continued fiscal consolidation, which has led to improvements in cyclically-adjusted primary balances for some (Figure 6). Most G20 advanced economies have managed to lower their deficit-to-GDP ratios since 2010; however, for most of these economies, debt-to-GDP ratios remain high (Figure 7).

In emerging market economies, public debt-to-GDP ratios have generally been lower than those in advanced economies but may rise at least in the short term due to various challenges from slowing growth to the lingering effects of lower commodity prices (Figure 8). Fiscal deficits are expected to rise as a share of GDP for most members in 2016 but then decline slightly in 2017 (Figure 9).

Over the past year, members have also made progress towards other general fiscal policy commitments. Among the most important commitments made prior to Brisbane, progress has been observed with some members' commitments to adjust taxation and expenditure policies to promote structural adjustment of economies (Brazil, China, France, Indonesia, Italy) and to improve fiscal frameworks (Spain). South Africa is also progressing with fiscal consolidation. Among commitments made in Brisbane, completed measures include those to reduce the tax burden of firms and households (China, France, Korea). As well, China, Canada, India, Indonesia and Korea are continuing to support demand through public investment.

Composition and Quality of Fiscal Policy

Key Commitments:

In 2014, G20 Finance Ministers, Central Bank Governors and Leaders committed to "consider how changes in the composition and quality of government expenditure and revenue may enhance the contribution of our fiscal strategies to growth".

Assessment of Progress:

Following extensive discussions in 2014 and again in 2015, G20 members have recognised the critical role growth friendly composition and efficiency of fiscal policy play in fostering global economic growth in both the short and medium term. However, members also noted that decisions with respect to the composition of fiscal policy are country specific and inherently political. Given that there are differing views within the FWG on the way to progress with this topic, members have had limited discussions in 2016 on the composition and quality of government expenditure and revenues. In particular, some members maintain that the focus should be on using fiscal space to support growth. However, members continue to be encouraged to review their tax and expenditure policy mixes, including by prioritizing high quality investment, to increase their growth-enhancing impact and voluntarily present the results in their 2016 growth strategy updates. Nevertheless, relatively few measures have been explicitly put forward. In this context, at their meeting in July 2016 in Chengdu, G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors invited the OECD and the IMF to continue the work on the composition of budget expenditure and revenue to support productivity, inclusiveness and growth.

3.2.2 Monetary Policy

Key Commitments:

G20 central banks remain focused on maintaining price and financial stability, and supporting the economic recovery according to their respective mandates.

Assessment of Progress:

Since the Antalya Summit, the most notable development has been the US Federal Reserve's first policy rate increase since 2006. In light of domestic and international developments since the start of the year, US monetary policy has remained accommodative and further changes are expected to be gradual. Meanwhile, both the European Central Bank (ECB) and Bank of Japan (BoJ) have engaged in further monetary policy easing in response to persistently low inflation. The ECB expanded its asset purchase program and cut policy rates, with the central bank deposit rate going further into negative territory. The BoJ adopted negative policy rates for the first time in its history, and more recently increased purchases of Exchange Traded Funds (ETFs) and took measures to ensure smooth funding in foreign currencies by Japanese firms and financial institutions. Other G20 central banks have also loosened monetary policy (Australia, India, Indonesia, Korea, Russia, UK) in an attempt to support economic growth and return inflation to target over an appropriate horizon. A few G20 members' central banks (Canada, India, Indonesia, Mexico, Saudi Arabia) have continued to contain inflation within the target range set by their respective mandates. However, a number of members such as Brazil, Russia, South Africa and Turkey are still facing inflation rates above target levels either this year or over the medium term (Figure 10). Argentina is also facing high inflation and the Central Bank has stated that the adoption of an inflation targeting regime will be announced in September 2016.

3.2.3 Exchange Rate Policy

Key Commitments:

G20 members remain committed to refrain from competitive devaluations and will not target exchange rates for competitive purposes. G20 members also remain committed to move towards more market-determined exchange rate systems and exchange rate flexibility to reflect underlying fundamentals, and avoid persistent exchange rate misalignments, while recognizing that excess volatility and disorderly movements in exchange rates can have adverse implications for economic and financial stability.

Assessment of Progress:

Progress in this area is ongoing (Figure 11). G20 advanced economies and many emerging market economies continue to have floating and free floating exchange rates and fully convertible currencies. In emerging markets, one of the key developments over the past year has been China's reform of its exchange rate mechanism to allow markets to play a greater role in determining the value of the currency. Moreover, Argentina has adopted a more market-determined exchange rate arrangement since December 17th 2015, when the Central Bank put in place a floating exchange rate regime.

The level of foreign exchange reserves declined in a number of emerging market economies in 2015, including many commodity-exporting economies (Figure 12 and 13).

3.2.4 Spillovers

Key Commitments:

As global trade and financial systems have become increasingly integrated, the potential for domestic policies to generate important spillovers to the rest of the global economy has increased. In Cannes and Los Cabos, the G20 committed to minimize the negative spillovers to other countries from policies implemented for domestic purposes. The need for minimizing negative spillovers was again reiterated by Leaders in Antalya in 2015.

Assessment of Progress:

Discussions on how to minimize negative spillovers were an important part of each FWG meeting's update on the global economic conjuncture, as well as during discussions on narrowing excess global imbalances and promoting inclusive growth. While less technical than scenario analysis undertaken in previous years to examine this topic, this year's discussions continued to provide a useful forum to help G20 members gain a better understanding of the potential impacts of key events in the global economy, including their transmission channels, and how they impact the balance and sustainability of global growth. Further, the international organizations continue to play an important role in the G20's efforts to generate positive spillovers through valuable research and policy recommendations that encourage a concerted effort at the global level.

4. Conclusion

The 2016 Accountability Assessment Report highlights the efforts by G20 members to foster strong, sustainable and balanced growth. While progress has been made, there is evidence that the G20 is falling short of its objective and thus needs to strengthen efforts to support growth and implement their growth strategy commitments. The global economic growth outlook remains weaker than desirable. In addition, there are important downside risks, policy space is constrained, and external imbalances did not continue their declining trend but have widened slightly in 2015. Furthermore, with respect to the policy actions G20 members put forward in their growth strategies, although 55 per cent of the Brisbane key commitments and 45 per cent of the Antalya key commitments have been fully implemented, the pace of implementation has been slower than initially expected by international organizations. In addition, a number of other structural reforms as well as fiscal, monetary and exchange rate commitments still need to be fully realized.

This year's assessment continues to highlight the need for G20 members to take concrete steps to ensure implementation of their growth strategy commitments in order to meet the collective growth ambition. Members may wish to prioritize implementation of policy actions that deliver growth impact in the short term, if appropriate. The G20 will continue to discuss how the assessment of the G20's progress on achieving strong, sustainable and balanced growth can be enhanced, as well as how monitoring and the peer review process can be strengthened to encourage members with the implementation and adjustment of their growth strategy commitments, including through the use of the enhanced structural reform agenda. The Framework Working Group will undertake another accountability assessment in 2017 enhanced by the structural reform priority areas and the indicator system. Results of this assessment will be presented in the 2017 Accountability Assessment Report at the 2017 Summit in Hamburg, Germany.

Annex 1:
Key Commitments from Brisbane and Antalya Growth Strategies

Argentina
1. Undertake public investment projects in energy and transport (Brisbane/Antalya) 2. Improve control mechanisms to reduce informality and increase labour demand, with a focus on SMEs (Brisbane) 3. Improve the entrance of young people into the labour market by helping complete their studies and/or their professional training and provide a state subsidy for wage costs for one year if a firm hires a youth completing a six-month internship. PROGRESAR consists of a money transfer made to young people, aged between 18 and 24, who want to return to school or to continue their studies (Brisbane/Antalya) 4. Expand eligibility for pensions (Brisbane/Antalya) 5. In order to spur investment by SMEs and increase financing for business investment and infrastructure projects, renew two key central bank credit programs (Brisbane) 6. Stimulus to the Investment in the exploration and production of oil and gas (Brisbane) 7. Completion of the Atucha II nuclear power plant (Brisbane) 8. Construction of two hydroelectric power stations along the Santa Cruz river (Brisbane) 9. Construction of the Northeast Gas Pipeline (GNEA) (Brisbane) 10. Revamping of the national railway system (Brisbane) 11. Electric interconnection between Yacyretá and Resistencia city (Brisbane/Antalya) 12. Electric interconnection between General Cerri and Mar del Plata (Brisbane/Antalya) 13. New Retirement Pension Plan (Law Nr. 26,970) (Brisbane/Antalya) 14. Support Investment for SMEs and infrastructure projects (Brisbane/Antalya)

Australia
1. Boost public infrastructure investment through the Infrastructure Growth Package (Brisbane) 2. Strengthen participation incentives through Active Labour Market Programmes, including education and training reforms (Brisbane) 3. Improve competition through reducing regulatory and administrative burdens (Brisbane) 4. Contribute to global trade liberalisation through Free Trade Agreements with Korea and Japan (Brisbane) 5. Create self-reliant industries through various funds amounting to A$1.4 billion (Brisbane) 6. Growing Jobs and Small Business Package (Antalya) 7. The *Jobs for Families* Child Care Package (Antalya) 8. Northern Australia Infrastructure Facility (Antalya) 9. China-Australia Free Trade Agreement (Antalya)
Brazil
1. Boost youth employment through encouraging SMEs as well as public administration to take on apprentices (*Pronatec Aprendiz*) (Brisbane) 2. Reduce red tape related to opening and operating businesses (Brisbane) 3. Improve the business environment for SMEs by increasing the access to capital markets for SMEs (Brisbane) 4. Advance trade facilitation by implementing the System for Consultation of Tariff Preferences Agreements tool (CAPTA) (Brisbane) 5. Increase the productivity of the economy through the National Education Plan (Brisbane) 6. Infrastructure Working Group. The creation of an infrastructure working group to identify market failures in infrastructure financing and propose solutions through regulatory reform (Brisbane) 7. Fiscal Consolidation Program for 2015-2017 (Antalya) 8. National Plan for Exports 2015-2018 (Antalya) 9. Concession Program: boost investment with 237 projects under implementation and more in the pipeline (Antalya)

Canada
1. Provide job seekers with modern and reliable tools to find jobs that match their skills and employers with better tools to look for qualified Canadians through enhanced Job Matching Service and a modernized National Job Bank (Brisbane) 2. Reduce barriers to entry and promote competition in the telecommunications sector through the introduction of a legislated cap on wholesale domestic wireless roaming rates, amendments to provide telecommunications regulators with the power to impose administrative monetary penalties, and announcement of an additional auction of commercial mobile spectrum in early 2015 (Brisbane) 3. Boost trade via the Canada-EU Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement and Canada-Korea Free Trade Agreements (Brisbane) 4. Lower small businesses' Employment Insurance (EI) premiums through the Small Business Job Credit (Brisbane) 5. Increase investment through an additional $1.3 billion in infrastructure investment to support additional strategic investment in public infrastructure and transportation services across Canada (Brisbane) 6. Accelerated capital cost allowance – Providing manufacturers with an accelerated capital cost allowance for machinery and equipment acquired after 2015 and before 2026 (Antalya) 7. Support to Provinces and Territories to Harmonize Apprenticeship Training – Support to Provinces and Territories for implementing recommendations made by the Canadian Council of Directors of Apprenticeship to harmonize apprenticeship training requirements in targeted Red Seal trades (Antalya)

China
1. Transform economic growth pattern to further boost consumption (Brisbane) 2. Further streamline administration to reduce approval and improve business climate (Brisbane) 3. Allow more private sector participation and ensure fair competition to activate the strength of the market (Brisbane) 4. Promote the orderly growth and opening up of the financial sector (Brisbane) 5. Implement the fiscal and tax reform, to improve economic efficiency (Brisbane) 6. Promote urbanization to foster investment and employment (Brisbane) 7. Improve the efficiency and quality of investment (Brisbane) 8. Reduce barriers to trade (Brisbane) 9. Participate actively in "post-Bali" negotiations of the WTO Doha Round and accelerate the FTA talks (Brisbane) 10. Boost employment by improving public services, ALMPs, tax policies and vocational training (Brisbane) 11. Expand effective investment in key areas, and let it play the multi-roles in stabilizing growth, adjusting structure and benefiting the people (Antalya) 12. Further streamline administrative procedures and delegate power to lower levels, and lift non-administrative permission and approval requirements so as to deepen reforms (Antalya) 13. Pass the Amendment to the Commercial Bank Law of the People's Republic of China (draft), including deleting the requirement that the deposit-to-debt ratio should not exceed 75% (Antalya)
European Union
1. Finalize and implement a genuine banking union based on a single rulebook, a single supervisory mechanism and a single resolution mechanism with a central decision-making board and a Single Resolution Fund (Brisbane) 2. Unlock public and private investment in the EU, including through the Investment Plan for Europe (Brisbane) 3. Address high unemployment, in particular youth unemployment and facilitate labour mobility (Brisbane) 4. Integrate the single market including in the services markets and network industries, while reducing administrative burdens (Brisbane) 5. Advance multilateral trade liberalization and the EU bilateral trade agenda (Brisbane) 6. Implement the Investment Plan for Europe (Antalya) 7. Building a Capital Markets Union (Antalya) 8. Boost financial resources to tackle unemployment and in particular youth unemployment (Antalya) 9. Further integrating the Single Market (Antalya)

France
1. Stimulate employment and improve businesses' competitiveness through the reduction of labour tax wedge (Brisbane) 2. Increase purchasing power and incentives to take up a job through the alleviation of the tax burden on low-income households (Brisbane) 3. Increase competition in services, particularly in the energy, healthcare, financial, legal and accounting services sectors (Brisbane) 4. Increase competitiveness through reducing administrative burdens and cutting red tape (Brisbane) 5. Improve the business environment by reducing the tax burden on firms (Brisbane) 6. Support pro-innovation investment (Brisbane) 7. Tackle unemployment by improving the vocational training system and enhancing public service efficiency (Brisbane) 8. Streamline the organization of local government (Brisbane) 9. Improving and flexibilizing the functioning of the labour market and promoting social dialogue in companies (Antalya) 10. Supporting the digitalization of the economy and the emergence of start-up companies (Antalya)
Germany
1. Additional public investment, especially in public infrastructure through measures with a total of €40 billion of additional money (Brisbane/Antalya) 2. Invest in research and education and implement the "High-Tech Strategy" (Brisbane/Antalya) 3. Boost female labour force participation (Brisbane/Antalya) 4. Increase competition through the evaluation of the Eighth Amendment to the Act Against Restraints of Competition, improving the administrative and court procedures for antitrust violations (Brisbane/Antalya)

India
1. Improving the macroeconomic policy response by setting up a monetary policy framework as well as rationalising public expenditure (Brisbane) 2. Enhancing infrastructure investment by raising long- term funding for the infrastructure sector, investing in mining and natural gas and promoting rural infrastructure (Brisbane) 3. Promoting employment and skills by setting up a Skill Development Ministry, promoting the education of girls, promoting MSMEs and providing new employment opportunities (Brisbane) 4. Improving competition/ ease of doing business by promoting FDI, improving digital infrastructure, and promoting better corporate governance (Brisbane) 5. Promoting financial inclusion and banking sector initiatives including by easing the licensing process for setting up new banks (Brisbane) 6. Trade policy initiatives including rationalising trade in both goods and services as well as creating a more efficient customs system (Brisbane) 7. Enhancing infrastructure investment by mobilising funds from MDBs, CPSEs (Central Public Sector Enterprises) and the National Investment and Infrastructure Fund (NIIF) (Antalya) 8. Promoting employment and skills particularly small entrepreneurs and the self-employed (Antalya) 9. Improving competition/ease of doing business by reducing the regulatory burden (Antalya)

Indonesia
1. Improve infrastructure investment perspective by establishing infrastructure body and PPP center (Brisbane) 2. Promote SMEs through fiscal and monetary policy supporting SMEs to get financial access easier (Brisbane) 3. Boost foreign investment by reducing administrative burden for foreign entities to establish a business in Indonesia (Brisbane) 4. Improve job matching by encouraging the private sector to provide training for those seeking jobs through tax incentives (Brisbane) 5. Address "behind the border" issues by implementing the WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement (Brisbane) 6. Increase infrastructure projects for food security, energy sustainability, and connectivity with more focus on our maritime advantages (Antalya) 7. Enlarge fiscal space to support prioritized programs and development agendas (infrastructure investment) through tax optimization and improvement of spending quality(Antalya) 8. Improve labor productivity and standard competency through cross sector – cross regional – cross country cooperation and business partner, partnership between government and business industry (Incentive), the optimization of public vocational training and training funding pattern in order to spur innovation and technology development (Antalya) 9. Improve market competition to support investment and trade activities (Antalya)
Italy
1. Make changes in the tax system to make it more transparent and growth-friendly (Brisbane) 2. Increase efficiency and transparency and reduce costs by simplifying procedure in justice system and public administration, while keeping the quality of services (Brisbane) 3. Reduce labour costs and make the labour market more efficient by increasing labour flexibility and simplifying procedures (Brisbane) 4. Tackle unemployment by ALMPs (Brisbane) 5. Boost female labour participation by introducing various measures to increase incentives for females to work (Brisbane) 6. Improve competition in network industries (Brisbane) 7. Reduce corruption to improve the business environment by improving institutional setting (Brisbane) 8. A comprehensive taxation plan to relaunch growth (Antalya) 9. A comprehensive reform of the banking system (Antalya)

Japan
1. Enhance corporate governance through the Corporate Governance Code which will be drafted by the Tokyo Stock Exchange (Brisbane/Antalya) 2. Improve the business environment by providing risk money to new technologies and ideas through security based crowd-funding or making regulatory restrictions transparent to enterprises (Brisbane/Antalya) 3. Reinvigorate the financial and capital markets and reform the management of public and quasi-public funds (Brisbane/Antalya) 4. Enhance the competitiveness of Japanese companies through promotion of a pro-growth corporate tax reform (Brisbane/Antalya) 5. Attract foreign enterprises and promote business start-ups through measures such as providing clarification on employment rules or acceptance of the foreign people in National Strategic Special Zones (Brisbane/Antalya) 6. Enhance women's participation by measures such as raising childcare leave benefits expanding childcare arrangements and reforming the working practice(Brisbane/Antalya) 7. Develop the agriculture industries as new growth engines through measures such as encouraging the diversification of distribution channels for dairy farmers (Brisbane/Antalya) 8. Develop health care industries as new growth engines through measures such as establishing a Medical Corporation for Community Health Care system in 2015 (Brisbane/Antalya) 9. Expand trade openness through trade facilitation measures (Brisbane/Antalya) 10. Promote exports of agricultural, forestry and fishery products as well as foods (Antalya) 11. Support for the creation of next-generation healthcare industry (Antalya) 12. Consideration of changes in industrial and employment structures due to Internet of Things, Big Data, and artificial intelligence (Antalya)

Korea
1. Boost domestic consumption by introducing "Three Tax Schemes" and expanding income and tax deduction (Brisbane) 2. Reduce the regulatory and administrative burden by reforming the regulatory system (Brisbane) 3. Improve employment prospects for youth, female and vulnerable groups by improving the apprenticeship, childcare services and part-time job opportunities in the public and private sector (Brisbane) 4. Enhance private investment via the increased use of PPPs (Brisbane) 5. Improve trade facilitation (Brisbane) 6. Increase competition in the services sector (Brisbane) 7. Promote private investment in R&D by setting up an "Investment Promotion Centre" to address difficulties with R&D investment (Brisbane) 8. Structural reform in four sectors in the areas of public, finance, education, and labor (Brisbane/Antalya)
Mexico
1. Energy Reform (Brisbane/Antalya) 2. Complete the secondary legislation of the Energy Reform (Brisbane) 3. Implement the Anti-trust Reform, including the recently approved secondary legislation (Brisbane) 4. Execute the National Infrastructure Program 2014-2018 in order to boost both public and private investment, thereby promoting domestic demand and job creation and leading to productivity increases (Brisbane) 5. Strengthen the role of National Development Banks for infrastructure and SME financing (Brisbane) 6. Fostering investment and infrastructure through the implementation of the Financial Reform and the National Infrastructure Fund (Brisbane/Antalya)

Russia

1. Enhancing the efficiency of the public investment, including the investment of the natural monopolies, through obligatory public technical and price audit of all large-scale projects even partially financed by the state (Brisbane/Antalya)
2. Implement large public investment projects partially financed through the Sovereign Wealth Fund (Brisbane/Antalya)
3. SME support: subsidies to SMEs, development of infrastructure for the entrepreneurship support in the regions of the Russian Federation (Brisbane/Antalya)
4. Agency for Credit Guarantees/ SMEs Corporation (Brisbane/Antalya)
5. Enhance customs administration (Brisbane/Antalya)
6. Supporting exporters and enhancing access to foreign markets (Brisbane/Antalya)

Saudi Arabia

1. Enhance technical and vocational training(Brisbane/Antalya)
2. Boost female labour force participation(Brisbane/Antalya)
3. Boost investment(Brisbane/Antalya)
4. Shift to greater private sector(Brisbane/Antalya)
5. Increase competition (Brisbane/Antalya)
6. Implement trade facilitation agreement and improve port capacity (Brisbane/Antalya)

South Africa

1. Streamline the regulatory regime: reduce compliance costs and facilitate access to equity finance (Antalya)
2. Expand and improve basic education and post-school training (Brisbane)
3. Improve the effectiveness of competition policy and reduce mark-ups, particularly in network industries (Brisbane)
4. Employment Tax Incentive, through which the government shares the initial cost of hiring with the employer to boost job creation (Brisbane/Antalya)
5. Improve investment environment for private sector (Antalya)
6. Facilitate cross-border trade and investment for South African firms (Brisbane/Antalya)
7. Fast-track implementation of the government’s infrastructure development plan (Brisbane/Antalya)

Spain
1. Implementation of the fiscal and tax reform measures to promote growth and employment creation (Brisbane/Antalya) 2. Advancing the deleveraging process. Facilitate the refinancing and restructuring of corporate debt. Fostering pre-insolvency negotiation and agreements (Brisbane/Antalya) 3. Boosting employment through regulatory reforms and other active labour market policies (ALMPs) (Brisbane/Antalya) 4. Continue implementing the regulatory simplification plan under the Market Unity Law aimed at fostering economic activity and increasing competitiveness of companies (Brisbane/Antalya) 5. Increasing the efficiency and quality of public expenditure and enhancing the transparency and efficiency of Public Administration (Brisbane/Antalya) 6. Reduce inflation inertia by limiting indexation in the public sector (Brisbane/Antalya) 7. Insolvency Law. Second opportunity mechanism (Brisbane/Antalya) 8. New measures in support of entrepreneurship aimed at complementing previous reforms and actions towards employment creation (Brisbane/Antalya) 9. Markets: More competitive functioning of markets and systemic efficiency and sustainability (Brisbane/Antalya)
Turkey
1. Increase the ratio of general R&D expenditures to GDP 1.80 per cent by 2018 from 0.95 per cent in 2013, and the share of SMEs in R&D expenditures to 20 per cent in the same period from 17 per cent as of 2013 (Brisbane/Antalya) 2. Increase competition by reviewing the legislation and other issues which prevents business environment to improve (Brisbane/Antalya) 3. Boost trade with implementation of the WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement (Brisbane/Antalya) 4. Raise employment through updated curricula for vocation schools, improving ALMPs, developing for target groups and introducing conditionality for social benefits (Brisbane/Antalya) 5. Increasing woman employment through creating a balance between work and family, introducing incentive regulations and promoting entrepreneurship (Brisbane/Antalya) 6. Reducing the share of young people who are most at risk of being permanently left behind in the labor market by 15% by 2025 (Antalya)

United Kingdom
1. Improve competition through reducing administrative and regulative burdens (Brisbane/Antalya) 2. Boosting support to help get young people and the long-term unemployed into work through various measures (Brisbane) 3. Building a stable housing market through creating of new housing zones or other number of measures (Brisbane/Antalya) 4. Increase female labour participation (Brisbane/Antalya) 5. National Insurance Contributions: Employment Allowance (Brisbane) 6. Small and Micro-Business Assessment for all domestic measures (Brisbane) 7. Support (public) infrastructure investment through various projects (Brisbane/Antalya) 8. Increasing the National Living Wage (Antalya) 9. Increasing the number of apprenticeships (Antalya) 10. National Insurance Contributions: Under 21s (Antalya) 11. Increasing the Apprentice National Minimum Wage Rate (Antalya) 12. Increasing the Annual Investment Allowance (Antalya)

United States
1. Undertake Federal investment of $302 billion over four years for surface transportation and infrastructure to improve roads, bridges, and transit systems (Brisbane) 2. To boost near-term demand and help address income inequality, raise the incomes of low wage workers and low income families through a $2.85 per hour increase in the federal minimum hourly wage, and permanently continue recent expansions to the Child Tax Credit (CTC) and Earned Income Tax Credit (EITC) and double the maximum EITC credit for workers without children from about $500 to about $1,000 (Brisbane) 3. Boost employment an labour force participation through skill training of long-term unemployed, existing workers and easing of child care costs, removing tax disincentives to work and strengthening workplace flexibility (Brisbane) 4. Create a single window documentation process for the export and import of cargo and completion of the International Trade Data System (ITDS), by December 2016 (Brisbane) 5. Undertake comprehensive immigration reform (Brisbane/Antalya) 6. Approve the Trans-Pacific Partnership and create a single-window documentation process for the export and import of cargo through completion of the International Trade Data System (ITDS) (Brisbane/Antalya) 7. Increase investment in surface transportation and related infrastructure (proposal adjusted to $478 billion over 6 years) (Antalya) 8. Boost incomes of low-wage workers and address inequality by raising the minimum wage and expanding selected individual tax credits (Antalya) 9. Boost employment and labor force participation by investing in education, training, and skills, and by promoting female labor force participation (Additional proposals to make two years of community college free for responsible students, implement the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA), and expand the American Opportunity Tax Credit) (Antalya)